Public Education Compensation Committee Meeting Minutes

May 15, 2023

Virtual Meeting

Anchor Location: Delaware Department of Education, Secretary's Office Suite, 401 Federal Street, Suite 2, Dover, DE 19901

The Public Education Compensation Committee (PECC) meeting was held virtually on May 15, 2023, with the following members in attendance:

Sara Hale, Heath Chasanov, Mark Holodick, Nicholas Konzelman, Cerron Cade, Alonna Berry, David Kohan, Stephanie Ingram, Jonathan Starkey, Ruth Ann Miller, Kimberly Williams, Alonna Berry, Chuck Longfellow, Michael Smith, Laura Sturgeon.

Also participating were Tina Shockley, Kimberly Klein, Sarah Barzee, Ione Heigham, Anna Sullivan, Nancy Tien, Bert Scoglietti, Christine Hubbard, Christy Wright, Deb Stevens, Jon Neubauer, Justin Richards, Katie Kotowski, Kiley Thompson, Meredith Seitz, Nicole Kennedy, Shreya Rawal, Shelley Meadowcroft, Taylor Hawk.

Audio Recording of Meeting

Welcome/Introductions

The Chair asked for a motion to begin the meeting. A motion was made by Jonathan Starkey and seconded by Dr. Sara Hale. All members were in favor and the meeting began at 4:32 p.m. ET. Tina Shockley conducted a member roll call and confirmed that a quorum was present.

Chair Holodick welcomed everyone and provided opening remarks, including thanks to the finance working group for their continued work to prepare for today's meeting which focused on Section 1322, school food service employees, and Section 1324, paraprofessionals. The Chair highlighted the fact that the agenda for this meeting has no action items due to the commitment made earlier in the process to introduce information and proposed recommendations one month and to vote on those recommendations at the following month's meeting. This provides PECC members the opportunity to review the information, and to share it with and seek feedback from their respective constituents. He also introduced an idea to form a second workgroup to address career ladders, teacher leadership and related issues. He sought feedback from PECC members. President Stephanie Ingram and Dr. Hale expressed support for convening a second working group. No members expressed opposition. Therefore, Chair Holodick invited members to submit recommendations for potential workgroup members to him via email.

Approval of April 17, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Chair Holodick requested a motion to approve the minutes from the April meeting. Dr. Hale motioned to approve the April 17, 2023 meeting minutes and Jonathan Starkey seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion carried. The meeting minutes for April 17 were approved. Chair Holodick introduced Dr. Sarah Barzee to facilitate the remainder of the meeting.

In Old Business, Dr. Barzee introduced Anna Sullivan from WestEd who will be stepping in for Nancy Tien during her parental leave. Dr. Barzee then reviewed the charge of SB100 and the scope and sequence for the remaining committee meetings. She reviewed the plan to introduce information and proposed recommendations for employee groups 1322 and 1324 at this meeting and as appropriate, to take action on those recommendations in June. Dr. Barzee then introduced Dr. Chuck Longfellow and Dr. Hale to provide information regarding Section 1322, food service employees and 1324, paraprofessionals.

In New Business, Dr. Longfellow shared Delaware's favorable standings compared with Maryland and Pennsylvania border districts regarding compensation for employees under Section 1322 and additional background information regarding the employee group. He then presented a recommendation from the work group for a one time 2.5% salary increase in fiscal year 2025, in addition to any general salary increase in that year. PECC members asked questions including one about the total salary for each worker, whether these employees work part or full time and whether they receive benefits. They also requested clarification about how the percentages were derived for the shared state and local costs. One member reminded the committee that the living wage should be kept at the forefront when discussing recommendations to keep employees in the public sector and avoid losing them to the private sector.

Dr. Barzee then reintroduced Dr. Hale to share information and recommendations for employees in Section 1324, paraprofessionals. Dr. Hale shared the total average starting salary for employees in this group compared to Maryland and Pennsylvania border districts and noted that positions in this employee group tend to be more often federally funded than other school-based positions. She also shared background information regarding employees covered by Section 1324, and noted salary increases for paraprofessionals based upon recommendations from the PECC in 2007. The proposed recommendation for Section 1324 is a 1% increase in FY25, an Associate's Degree and ParaPro Certification stipend increase to \$1,000 and the creation of a Bachelor's Degree stipend of \$2,000. During the discussion, a PECC member reminded the group that the recommendations should clearly state that the state is not funding federal positions. It was also noted that there may be cases in which a paraprofessionals salary decreases when transitioning from paraprofessional to classroom teacher roles. It was also noted that Delaware is already regionally competitive for this employee group so there were questions about the need for a recommendation to increase salaries. A member noted the continued shortage of support professionals and the importance of attracting more to the field. Another member noted the difficulty balancing regional competitiveness and compensation pressure from the private sector when the state has limited resources and those resources should go to the groups whose salaries are not currently regionally competitive. A member reminded the committee that these employee groups also receive pension and health care benefits while many in the private sector no longer have a pension. Dr. Hale asked the group for feedback regarding the recommendations regarding stipends for Associate's and Bachelor's degrees for employees in Section 1324. There was some support for this recommendation.

In Next Steps, PECC members will vote on recommendations for employees covered under Section 1322 and 1324 at the June 12, 2023 meeting, as appropriate. Dr. Barzee reminded members that communication, including meeting reminders, Zoom links and meeting materials will come from Anna Sullivan rather than Nancy Tien over the next several months. Before closing, the Chair asked PECC members to seek feedback ahead of next month's meeting regarding today's recommendations and send suggestions regarding interested individuals for the new workgroup via email.

Public Comment

There were no individuals who signed up to provide public comment.

Adjournment

Dr. Barzee asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Rep. Williams motioned to adjourn and Director Cade seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion was carried. The meeting adjourned at 5:23 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted, Nancy Tien for WestEd

Updated on 5.18.2023



Public Education Compensation Committee (PECC) Meeting

May 15, 2023 4:30 - 6:00 PM



Welcome and Remarks from the Chair





Meeting the Charge of SB 100

- 1. Make recommendations that strengthen Delaware's ability to compete with regional school districts in recruiting and retaining qualified and diverse educators.
- Make recommendations for competitive base pay for educators at all steps in the compensation structure.
- 3. Make recommendations for achieving competitive career level earnings in fewer, more meaningful steps.
- 4. Specify how educators can achieve additional opportunities for career advancement...based on acquisition of relevant degrees, certifications, and competencies, the acceptance of leadership responsibilities, and must fairly compensate for additional professional responsibilities.
- 5. Make recommendations that include approaches to the acquisition of skills and knowledge that are timely, relevant, and affordable.
- 6. Provide recommendations on the creation of leadership roles through which educators will receive additional compensation for assuming leadership responsibilities.
- 7. Additional compensation for professional responsibilities that are not generally required in the classroom
- 8. Applicability of new system for individuals paid under §§ 1305, 1306, 1307, 1310 and 1321
- 9 Increase base levels of pay for education support staff as defined by §§ 1308, 1311, 1322, and 1324



Title 14, Chapter 13 Salaries and Working Conditions of School Employees

| 1305 | Basic salary schedule for teachers , nurses , principals , superintendents , and |
|------|--|
| | other administrative and supervisory employees |

- **1306** Salary schedule for **chief school officers**
- **1307** Salary schedule for **principals** subordinate to a chief school officer
- 1308 Salary schedules for administrative secretaries, financial secretaries, senior secretaries, secretaries and clerks
- **1311** Salary schedule for **school custodians**
- 1322 Salary schedule for school food service employees
- 1324 Salary schedule for paraprofessionals

Note: SB100 also addresses job categories where state pay scales do not exist, including bus drivers and information technology employees.



Scope and Sequence to Address SB100

| Employee Group | Presentation and Discussion | Decision/ Recommendation |
|---|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1305 teachers, nurses, principals, superintendents, and other administrative and supervisory employees | January | March |
| 1308 administrative secretaries, financial secretaries, senior secretaries, secretaries and clerks | March | April |
| 1311 school custodians | March | April |
| 1322 school food service employees | May | June |
| 1324 paraprofessionals | May | June |
| bus drivers | June | July |
| information technology employees | July | August |
| Other charges from SB100 (e.g. teacher leadership, pathways, etc.) | | |

1322 Salary Cost Options





1322 Total Average Starting Wages by State

| | DE Districts Salary (2022-2023) | MD Border Districts Salary (2022-2023) | PA Border Districts Salary (2022-2023) |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| General Worker Step 1 | \$17.13/hr | \$14.30/hr | \$16.77/hr |
| General Worker Step 10 | \$18.57/hr | \$16.38/hr | n/a |
| Cook Step 1 | \$18.21/hr | \$14.96/hr | \$17.34/hr |
| Cook Step 10 | \$19.62/hr | \$18.30/hr | n/a |
| Manager, Below 351 Step 1 | \$28,609 | \$23,841 | \$24,417 |
| Manager, Below 351 Step 10 | \$33,775 | \$29,667 | n/a |



1322a and 1322c Overview

- 1322a Food Service Managers and 1322c Lunch Cooks and General Workers
- School Food Service Managers work 185 days a year.
- The State funds 73% of the salary schedule for Food Service
 Managers and 62% of the salary schedule for Lunch Cooks and
 General Workers.
- For those districts that pay additional wages above 100% of the state salary schedule, they may continue to do so.



1322 Proposed Recommendation (for FY25)

Proposed recommendation: 2.5% increase in FY25 for all.

| | DE Step 1 Salary Schedule with 3% General Increase (FY24) | DE Adjusted Step 1 Salary Schedule with 2.5% Increase (FY25) |
|-----------------------------|--|--|
| General Worker | \$14.64/hr | \$15.01/hr |
| Lunch Cook | \$15.53/hr | \$15.92/hr |
| Manager, Below 351 Students | \$22,239 | \$22,795 |
| Manager, 351-500 | \$23,266 | \$23,848 |
| Manager, 501-800 | \$24,289 | \$24,896 |
| Manager, 801-1200 | \$25,311 | \$25,944 |
| Manager, 1201-1600 | \$26,320 | \$26,978 |
| Manager, 1601-2000 | \$27,561 | \$28,250 |
| Manager, 2000+ | \$28,176 | \$28,880 |



1322 Salary Cost Option

Proposed recommendation: 2.5% increase in FY25 for all.

| | | Total Cost | Total Cost w/ OECs | Increase to Base |
|--|-------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Section 1322 (Lunch Cook, Manager) | خ | 20,385,412 | 26 804 474 | 1 771 224 |
| General/Cook increase by 2.5% to \$15.01/h Food Service Manager increase by 2.5% | ې nour r | assess • trade and • title as ev | 26,894,474 | 1,771,234 1,490,380 280,854 |







1324 Total Average Starting Salary by State

| | DE Districts Salary | MD Border Districts Salary | PA Border Districts Salary |
|----------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Service Para Step 1 | \$28,220 | \$20,473 | \$21,715 |
| Service Para Step 10 | \$38,732 | \$27,172 | \$24,961** |
| Instructional Para Step 1 | \$29,970 | \$21,513 | \$22,672 |
| Instructional Para Step 10 | \$41,192 | \$28,211 | \$24,961** |

^{**} only one district



1324 Overview

- Most are 10-month employees and work 185 days a year. In SY22-23:
 - 450 Service Paraprofessionals provide support services other than instructional assistance.
 - 2,767 Instructional Paraprofessionals provide instructional assistance to students.
- Currently, Instructional Paraprofessionals who have received an associate degree, completed a minimum of 60 semester credits or have successfully passed a comprehensive testing mechanism, receive an annual salary stipend supplement in the amount of \$662.
- In its report dated May 16, 2007, the Public Education Compensation Committee reviewed the status of Paraprofessional salaries and made several recommendations to provide competitive salaries.
 - Implementation of those recommendations began in Fiscal 2008 and completed in Fiscal 2016, with implementation being delayed between Fiscal 2009 and 2011 due to fiscal constraints.
 - During this time period, the Paraprofessional scale was collapsed from 24 to 10 steps, and they received salary increases ranging between 2% and 6% per year.
 - This was a 26.1% total increase between Fiscal 2008 and 2016 to Paraprofessional salaries state share.



1324 Proposed Recommendation (for FY25)

Proposed recommendation: 1% increase in FY25 for all, and Associate Degree and ParaPro Certification level stipend increased to \$1,000, and create Bachelor Degree level stipend of \$2,000.

| | Salary State Contribution with 3% General Increase (FY24) | Adjusted State Contribution with 1% Flat Increase and Stipends (FY25) |
|--|--|---|
| Service Paraprofessional Step 1 | \$23,835 | \$24,073 |
| Service Paraprofessional Step 10 | \$33,577 | \$33,913 |
| Instructional Paraprofessional Step 1 | \$26,822 | \$27,090 |
| Instructional Paraprofessional Step 10 | \$37,991 | \$38,371 |

Salary numbers only reflect state contribution.



1324 Salary Cost Option

Proposed recommendation: 1% increase in FY25 for all, and Associate Degree and ParaPro Certification level stipend increased to \$1,000, and create Bachelor Degree level stipend of \$2,000.

| | Total Cost | Total Cost w/ OECs | Increase to Base |
|---|----------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Section 1324 (Aides / Paraprofessionals) Increase scale by 1% Modify Education Stipends | \$ 108,568,599 | 143,234,553 | 3,096,586 1,367,086 1,729,500 |

Discussion



Next Steps

Review and Discuss:

• Recommendations and Committee Action

Introduce:

Bus Drivers





Upcoming Meeting Schedule

| June 12, 2023 |
|--------------------|
| August 14, 2023 |
| September 18, 2023 |
| October 16, 2023 |
| November 13, 2023 |



Public Comment

- Members of the public are welcome to speak before the PECC during the scheduled public comment period as noted on the publicly posted meeting agendas. Interested persons should:
 - (1) send their name, the name of the group they represent and the topic of their comment via email to DOE, ideally 7 days in advance of the meeting, to request to have their name put on the public comment list for the upcoming meeting;
 - OR (2) raise their hand during the meeting. Those who register ahead of time will be called on by the facilitator to provide public comment first, followed by those who raise their hand during the meeting.
- In order to provide all members of the public with an equal opportunity to speak before the PECC, each individual is limited to <u>two minutes</u>, unless otherwise noted at the beginning of the meeting.
- Public comments received by DOE 7 days in advance will be sent to members with advance meeting materials via email. All written public comments will be included with the meeting minutes and publicly posted following each committee meeting.

Thank You | Comparison of Education | Compa